

LETTER FROM P.W. CAINE TO SOPHIA MORRISON *
(20 FEBRUARY 1915)

“Hazel Dene” | Stanley Mount | Ramsey.
Feb. 20, '15.

Dear Miss Morrison

I am grateful for the privilege of having seen this collection, & I only hope I have not inconvenienced you by having detained the books so long. I have made a careful study of them, though I think I might have spared myself the trouble, for the collection has been edited & arranged with singular ability. If the editor & arranger should happen to have been Miss Morrison, I am all the more happy to make the acknowledgement. But I enclose certain notes that I have made as the result of my study. Most of them, I doubt not, are pretty obvious resemblances that don't signify anything in particular, though in one or two cases—notably in Gill's “Aarey Jacob” & two or three others which I have compared ‘with’ it—I feel pretty certain that one here was intentionally founded on the other. But there are eight or nine cases where I am satisfied that the two tunes do not merely resemble one another, but are definitely the same tune with variations.

One of them I'm sorry to discover. “Nagh² nee shen my ghraih,” to which I have written words, is [*deleted start of word*] manifestly the same tune, with slight variations, as “Farmer's Daughters,” No 1. Have you noticed the liberty which Gill took with “My ghraih ta gollosh yn ghraih”? No wonder I was puzzled, when writing words for it, to make out what measure the original song had been written in! It was the measure of the “The Loss of the Herring Fleet.” & the hymn “All ye that [*deleted start of word*] What it is when Gill has [*d* overwritten] done with it Gill only knows. On the subject of probable foundation of one tune upon the other, look up “Sheign Dooin” & one of the “Thurots.”

How far are all the tunes in this collection Manx? Well, a great many of them have been published now for nearly twenty years; let the rightful owners claim their own. I have made a careful comparison of these with 124 Irish tunes contained in Moore's “Irish Melodies,” & I can only allow Moore two of ours. One I gave away with great regret—“Farmer's Daughters, No 2.” ~~Gill~~ I notice this collection gives that tune the

* Letter from P.W. Caine to Sophia Morrison, 20 February 1915, with attached “Notes on Dr Clague's Collection of Manx Tunes.” MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 1. Referenced in Stephen Miller, “Notes on Dr Clague's Collection of Manx Tunes.’ P.W. Caine and the Clague Collection (1915),” *Kiaull Manninagh Jiu* January (2023), [20].

title of “Kiark Catreney Maroo,” but it isn’t Moore’s “Kiark Catreney Marroo.” But it certainly is,

with variations, the same as the Irish air to which Moore wrote “Ne’er ask the hour.”³ Similarly, No 21 in this collection is, with variations, the same as Moore’s “Fill the bumper fair.” I’ve no doubt that some others in this collection would have to be handed over, if the owners came forward—114, for example. There are dozens of tunes in Moore that are exactly of the same style school as that. The supposed titled, “Ta billey veg glass ayns garey my yishag,” is, as I think I have pointed out before, a line out of the ballad, “Keayrt va mee aeg.” And I wish I could believe that Mannin deserved the credit for such gems as “Yn spey er my gheaylin,” “Tra ta mee ghill neel s’lhie,” “V’ad traue ny Keeayn,” “December is fairer than May,” & “Arrane yn Chloieder-Viol.” Those are, I suppose, what ~~Moore~~ Gill had in his mind when he said some of the collection belonged to the Old English style. (By the way, let me salute the memory of Charles Clague. I don’t know who he was, but he had a marvellous ear for good sweet music. Tom Kermodé’s range is much wider, but Clague’s is select.) But still, if we didn’t create, we preserved, & that was worth doing. The wonder, indeed, is that Mannin should have possessed

a school of its own. The Dorian school of the ABBA style of ‘verse’ construction⁴ seem ~~to be~~ ‘pretty nearly’ distinctive & in addition, we must have built very ~~considerably~~ ‘extensively’ on the Irish model.

I enclose a list of carvals for which tunes have been found, though I dare say the compilers of the collection has anticipated me in that direction, also. It’s remarkable that though I have by now 32 carvals hitherto unpublished, & the collection contains sundry titles for which Moore’s Book of Carvals affords no clue, yet none of those titles is applicable to my set of carvals. As for tunes, I think that “O cre ta dooinney?” (242 & 254) is a magnificent find. Words & music combined afford a splendid illustration of the Manx carval at its best—what I have before described as the true Dorian mode (or mood)—reflective, pensive, but not actually melancholy. The carval has the advantage, too, of having quite a respectable translation into English. Here’s a suggestion, now, for a Guild Manx music class.

I like Mr Gill’s own compositions, though they are neither “Manxy” or particularly original. But they’ll sing well, & I’d like to see them taken up.

Commendations on the London Manx Society!⁵ would that we could get off our Forbes celebrations as promptly & as effectively! And oh, if I felt myself free to do it, wouldn’t I like to write an open letter to “my dear Caine”—WRHC! What pleasure would I have in reassuring him from any fears he may have of having a bust erected

to him when he is gone, or of being receiving that most deadly of insults—“damning with faint praise”—being referred to as a “genius,” or, worse still, a “gentleman”!

Yours faithfully | Philip W Caine

ATTACHMENT (1)

Carols for which tunes exist

A.W. Moore’s book, page	1	Gill, No. 16
	31	Clague, No. 232
	71	Gill, No. 30
		Clague, No. 233
	76	Clague, No. 235–9
	81	Gill, No. 21
	87	Gill, No. 4 & 18
		(18 very fine)
	97	Gill, No. 20
	99	Gill, No. 15
		Clague, No. 245–8
	115	Clague, No. 249
	129	Gill, No. 24
		Variants in Clague
	152,	Clague, 252 & 253
	159	Clague, No. 255
	218	Gill, No. 23
		Clague, 256
	236	Gill, Nos. 10 & 11
		Clague, 258–264

ATTACHMENT (2)

Notes on Dr Clague’s Collection of Manx Tunes

No. 6 cf. w. 136, 172, 256, 287

19 cf. w. 82

16 cf. w. 39.

~~78~~

30 cf. w. 78, 136, 295

* 39 cf. w. 16

* 78 cf. w. 30, 136, 295
90 cf. w. 177 & 178
103 cf. w. 124, 181, 189, 304
108—sung in Canon Quine’s play, “Kitty’s Affair,” to words composed by him
109 variant of 89
110 cf. 115 & 149
* 115 cf. 110 & 149
119 & 120 cf. 131, 138, 152
* 124cf. 103, 181, 189, 304
* 131 cf. 119, 120, 138, 152
* 138 cf. 119, 120, 131, 152
* 136 cf. 30, 78, 295
137 variant of 2423—cf. 254
* 149 cf 110 & 115
* 172 cf. 6, 136, 256, 287
174 & 175 variants of 73 7 74
* 181 cf 103, 124, 189, 304
182 cf. 64

2

* 189 cf. 103, 124, 181 [9 *overwritten*], 304
191 = “Ushtey Millish” in Moore’s Ballads—cf 275
194 cf. 261 & 262
220 cf. 263
253 variant of 241
* 254 variant of 242—cf 137
* 256 cf. 6, 136, 172, 287
257—a Sankey tune, “Hiding in Thee”
* 261 & 262 cf. 194
276 cf. 297
* 287 cf 6, 136, 172, 256
293 variant of 244
* 295 cf. 30, 78, 136
* 297 cf. 276
298 variant of 262
301 variant of 250 & 251
303 cf. 161

304 cf 124, 103, 181, 189

305 variant of 252

268—Moore's "Dooiney seyr veih Exeter"

123—words in Moore, p. 38

235 et seq—variants of 196

*—already referred to under previous numbers

*